Case 2:08-cv-00575-GLF-NMK Document 71-5 Filed 01/07/10 Page 1 of 2 Transcript page 4618 and 348

Page 4617

- 1 article, the Smithsonian article and Schweitzer's discovery.
- 2 It's a pretty amazing discovery.
- 3 Q. During your previous testimony, you talked about the
- 4 hydrosphere. John, real simply, is the hydrosphere a
- 5 hypothesis or a theory?
- 6 A. It's a hypothesis.
- 7 Q. Now, previously when you testified, you articulated that
- 8 it was a theory, so is your previous testimony right or is
- 9 your previous testimony wrong as it relates to the
- 10 hydrosphere?
- 11 A. It's a hypothesis.
- 12 Q. Okav.
- 13 A. So theory would be incorrect.
- 14 Q. Now, your personnel evaluation from October 20th, 2002,
- 15 the one that states a hypothesis is an educated guess, is
- 16 that still your correct understanding as to what a hypothesis
- 17 is?
- 18 A. Yes, that's a -- that's a way that I would explain it.
- 19 Q. I'm going to hand you Employee Exhibit 114 and 112. One
- 20 is the astronomy book and one is the cell book. In the red
- 21 book, the astronomy book, I direct your attention to page
- 22 50-51. And in the green book, the cell book, I'm directing
- 23 your attention to page 138 and 139. Take a look at them.
- 24 A. Okay.
- 25 Q. Now, in the one book, did it mention the word

Page 4618

- 1 "hypothesis," like, three times on one page as it relates to
- 2 the early atmosphere of the earth?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And in the other book, is it talking about the early
- 5 beginnings of the earth?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Are these the places where you would have talked about
- 8 the hydrosphere theory or the hydrosphere hypothesis?
- 9 A. Yes. This would be the spot, yes.
- 10 Q. And is the hydrosphere anything more than a hypothesis?
- 11 A. It's a hypothesis, just like the hypothesis on page
- 12 50-51. Again, we're getting into that which I tried to
- 13 discuss a little earlier today, is the concrete/abstract
- 14 thinking, where extrapolating evidence, information back and
- 15 trying to make -- infer what the atmosphere looked like. And
- 16 it was just -- we don't have eyewitnesses, so we are using
- 17 evidence we have today and extrapolating backwards and trying
- 18 to figure out what it is.
- 19 Q. Now, Zach Dennis testified that you didn't specifically
- 20 mention Noah's flood but that he implied Noah's flood from
- 21 this discussion about the hypothesis regarding the
- 22 hydrosphere. Very specifically, were you trying to promote
- 23 the biblical story of Noah's flood from the discussion of the
- 24 hydrosphere hypothesis?
- 25 A. No.

Page 4619

- Q. Now, are you supposed to talk about hypothesis as part
- 2 of your academic content standards?
- 3 A. Absolutely.
- 4 Q. Okay. And on page 216 of Board Exhibit No. 37, take a
- 5 look there at Benchmark A.
- 6 A. I'd have to go back to page 215 on that.
- 7 Q. Is part of the -- I'm sorry, it's on page 215. You're
- 8 right.
- 9 Earlier, you testified that the eighth grade indicator
- 0 that under nature of science is essentially the scientific
- 11 method. Right?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And hypothesis is something you're supposed to study as
- 14 part of the scientific method. Correct?
- 15 A. Yes. You can actually see that there in Benchmark A.
- 16 Q. John, your previous testimony, and we learned from
- 17 Carrie Mahan, that there was a debate that took place in your
- 18 class with regard to creation versus evolution. Do you
- 19 recall that testimony?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Now, are you familiar with the board policy -- I'm
- 22 handing you Employee Exhibit 84 as it relates to academic
- 23 freedom of teachers. Do you see that?
- 24 A. Yes
- 25 Q. Do you see it says, "Teachers and students need to be

Page 4620

- 1 free to discuss and debate ideas"?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. And you've been involved in other debates in
- 4 Mr. Elifritz's class. Right?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Now, Carrie Mahan testified that the debate with the
- 7 creation and evolution, that the students wanted to do that.
- 8 Is that your understanding of how this came together?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Was it permissible to let the students have that debate?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Did you have to get approval to have that debate?
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. Now, here's something people may not appreciate. Was
- 15 that particular debate regarding creation versus evolution
- 16 held in every one of your eighth grade science classes during
- 17 the class year of 2007-2008?
- 18 A. No, it was not. Only that one because the kids
- 19 initiated it.
- 20 Q. Okay. So let me make sure. You did not have that same
- 21 debate in every one of your classes?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. Okay. Which class did that debate take place in?
- 24 A. That was the eighth period, eighth grade class.
- 25 Q. And do you recall how that -- how did the students

Case 2:08-cv-00575-GLF-NMK Document 71-5 Filed 01/07/10 Page 2 of 2

1

Page 348

- 1 A. It was how dinosaurs could live in areas like Alaska and
- 2 Antarctica, where they find greenhouse gases and fossils and
- 3 how fish fossils can be found on top of mountains. And it
- 4 was, the earth was, surrounded by, like, a dome of water,
- 5 condensed water, and then it could make it humid for
- 6 dinosaurs to live anywhere. And then one time it broke, it
- 7 flooded, so fish -- so it rose and then fish would be stuck
- 8 on top of mountains. And then the water flowed back out
- 9 again, and that was what killed a lot of dinosaurs and the
- 10 species.
- 11 Q. And was the implication of that that was the great flood
- 12 that Noah --
- 13 A. He didn't say that, but I took it that way.
- 14 Q. Did he indicate that that was evidence that the
- 15 dinosaurs lived at the same time as man as far as that? Do
- 16 you recall?
- 17 A. I don't remember.
- 18 Q. Now, you indicated that Mr. Freshwater handed out a
- 19 packet on Mount Saint Helens that you had to turn back in.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Were there other occasions that he handed out packets
- 22 that had to be turned back in?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Do you have any other examples of that that you can
- 25 recall at this time?

Page 349

- 1 A. There was one about Albert Einstein. And we did other
- 2 ones on sound waves and different kind of electrical waves.
- 3 like microwaves and radio waves and other examples. There
- 4 were a lot of other packets.
- 5 Q. Was there ever any phrase, that special phrase that
- 6 Mr. Freshwater asked students to use in conjunction --
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. -- with their class?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. What was that phrase?
- 11 A. Here.
- 12 Q. And could you explain how that was to be used?
- 13 A. It was used -- in the textbook, when something was
- 14 stated as a fact that wasn't necessarily proven, we'd say
- 15 "here" after that.
- 16 Q. Now, in your class, did you study the periodic table?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. And about how long did you study that?
- 19 A. A few weeks. We memorized a certain number of them.
- 20 Q. And did Mr. Freshwater ever give extra credit
- 21 assignments?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. And is there any that he gave relating to intelligent
- 24 design?
- 25 A. Yes.

- Q. What was that extra credit assignment?
- A. It was to go see the movie Expelled and write a
- 3 nonbiased paragraph about it.
- 4 Q. And did he talk about that movie to the Fellowship of
- 5 Christian Athletes as well?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. And could you tell us what he did at Fellowship of
- 8 Christian Athletes with respect to that movie?
- 9 A. He got the kids together one Friday, I believe, to go
- 10 see it. And, also, he asked us to encourage the movie
- 11 theaters to play it there.
- 12 Q. By the way, did you ever study magnetism in class?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. And do you recall anything of the discussions by
- 15 Mr. Freshwater about magnets?
- 16 A. About magnets, that opposites attract, and it should be
- 17 the same with humans.
- 18 Q. Okay. Let's change the subject again if we could. Talk
- 19 about the Fellowship of Christian Athletes. Do you know --
- 20 what's the Fellowship of Christian Athletes?
- 21 A. A time for Christian athletes to meet and talk about
- 22 God.
- 23 Q. And were you part of the Fellowship of Christian
- 24 Athletes --
- 25 A. Yes.

1 Q. -- last year?

- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. And how often did you meet?
- 4 A. Every Monday and Tuesday.
- 5 Q. Now, what were the different meetings?
- 6 A. Monday was in Mr. Freshwater's room, and it was the
- 7 leadership meeting, which was when we would watch movies and
- 8 talk about different things going on at churches.
- 9 Q. Okay. And who showed movies?
- d. Chay. And who showed
- 10 A. Mr. Freshwater.
- 11 Q. Who picked the movies?
- 12 A. I believe Mr. Freshwater did.
- 13 Q. What are some of the movies that he showed you?
- 14 A. One was on Islam, the Islam point of view for
- 15 terrorists. It was Obsession.
- 16 Q. Other kinds of movies that were shown?
- 17 A. There was Invisible Children, which is about college
- 18 kids making a documentary in Africa.
- 19 Q. Okay.
- 20 A. And there was another movie that I remember, but I don't
- 21 remember what it was called. It was just about different
- 22 points of views of people.
- 23 Q. What else happened at the leadership meetings?
- 24 A. Occasionally, we would call speakers. We'd pray. We'd
- 25 talk about different things going on in the churches, about

Page 351

Page 350